

**CITY OF TEMPE  
REQUEST FOR COUNCIL ACTION**

**Council Meeting Date: 01/14/2016  
Agenda Item: 5B5**

**ACTION:** Award a one-year contract with four, one-year renewal options to North Star Destination Strategies, which will act as the consultant for the 'Branding of Tempe' project.

**FISCAL IMPACT:** Total cost of this one-year contract will not exceed \$100,000. Sufficient funds have been budgeted in the Restricted Revenue & Donations Fund – cost center 44106 (Tempe 11) – for the anticipated expenditure in the current fiscal year.

**RECOMMENDATION:** Award the contract.

**BACKGROUND INFORMATION:** (RFP 15-148) The City of Tempe issued a Request for Proposal (RFP) to establish a contract to secure the services of a qualified consultant to assist with the 'Branding of Tempe' project.

A brand is the emotionally felt, motivating character of a product, or, in this case, a place. Tempe's character is already felt in various ways by stakeholders, including residents, businesses and visitors. The branding process is about uncovering those individual feelings and solidifying/unifying them in order to create and maintain a preference for Tempe as a place to live, do business and visit. The end product will guide City communication activities for years since the essence of what is appealing and motivating about Tempe is not fleeting, only the specific tactics needed to communicate that essence may change.

Work would begin in early 2016 and take roughly 6 months to complete. The development of the Tempe brand would include; meetings with stakeholders (both inside and outside of the community), meetings with Council, statistically significant surveys, research, brainstorming sessions and more. The recommended brand for Tempe will be the result of solid research and strategy developed with the consultant.

Four renewal options have been incorporated into the contract to allow for future potential assistance as the branding program is implemented.

Evaluation Process

Twenty proposals were received and evaluated by a review committee made up of individuals from; City of Tempe, Arizona State University, Tempe Chamber of Commerce, Tempe Tourism Office and Downtown Tempe Authority. A multi-step process was utilized which has taken approximately 6 months to complete.

The offers were reviewed and evaluated on the following criteria:

Criteria	Weight
Cost	6 (38%)
Project development	
Hourly rate	
Firm	5 (31%)
Qualifications	
Experience with similar projects	
References	
Project Approach	4 (25%)
Understanding of scope of services	
Proposed methodology	
Timeline for development	
Overall response to RFP	1 ( 6%)
Quality, composition & completeness	
Acceptance of terms and conditions	
Interview – if held	100 points

### Step 1

Each individual committee member separately scored the firms based on submitted proposals. The table below contains the result of that process:

Firm Name	Score	Submitted Cost
Cubic	132.19	\$48,000
North Star Destination Strategies	130.22	\$82,200
Esser Design	129.95	\$38,000
Lucid Agency	125.97	\$39,990
Strategic Advisory Group	125.61	\$48,000
Awe Collective	117.89	\$32,225
Kitchen Sink Studios	114.44	\$48,000
Owens Harkey Advertising	111.11	\$95,700
HAPI	110.73	\$75,000
Six Degrees	109.26	\$99,300
Sitewire	105.23	\$78,000
Marketing QuarterBack Consulting	102.17	\$32,355
BJC Public Relations	101.34	\$98,000
On Advertising	98.23	\$86,465
The Research Associates	96.62	\$78,000
Addison Whitney	79.51	\$171,000
Allison & Partners	78.54	\$163,000
AMF Media Group	75.47	\$165,000
New England Consulting Group	72.78	\$575,000
Licensing Brands	70.51	\$164,227

### Step 2

After a committee discussion of the individual committee members scoring, where individuals introduced observations and opinions related to the submittals, the top 10 scoring firms were further evaluated based on discussion information. Only factors related to qualification and suitability of proposals were reevaluated. The table below contains the result of that process:

Firm Name	Score	Submitted Cost
Cubic	139.84	\$48,000
North Star Destination Strategies	134.22	\$82,200
Strategic Advisory Group	123.37	\$48,000
Owens Harkey Advertising	115.90	\$95,700
Lucid Agency	114.38	\$39,990
Esser Design	113.79	\$38,000
Six Degrees	110.38	\$99,300
Kitchen Sink Studios	109.82	\$48,000
Awe Collective	107.96	\$32,225
HAPI	101.75	\$75,000

### Step 3

The top seven scoring firms were invited to participate in one-hour interviews in which the firms were given the opportunity to describe their process, highlight their expertise and answer questions from the committee. The table below contains the result of that process:

Firm Name	Interview Score	Step 2 Score	Total	Submitted Cost
North Star Destination Strategies	100.00	134.22	234.22	\$82,200
Cubic	85.00	139.84	224.84	\$48,000
Strategic Advisory Group	80.00	123.37	203.37	\$48,000
Owens Harkey Advertising	80.00	115.90	195.90	\$95,700
Six Degrees	70.00	110.38	180.38	\$99,300
Lucid Agency	50.00	114.38	164.38	\$39,990
Esser Design	50.00	113.79	163.79	\$38,000

## Recommendation

The committee believes that some of the submitting firms, while well qualified as ad agencies or website designers, did not have the expertise necessary to craft a successful 'branding' campaign as requested by the Request for Proposal. While pricing is an important consideration in any evaluation, the qualifications and experience of a firm are more critical elements when a contract of this nature is considered.

North Star Destinations Strategies, who has assisted with the successful branding campaigns of a multitude of cities including; Providence, Columbus and Fargo, to name a few, possesses the highest qualifications and experience of the submitting firms.

It is the unanimous recommendation of the review committee to award a contract to North Star Destination Strategies.

**ATTACHMENTS:** Vendor offer page.

**STAFF CONTACT(S):** Nikki Ripley, Communication and Media Relations Manager, (480) 350-8846

Department Director: Renie Broderick, Internal Services Director

Legal review by: David Park, Assistant City Attorney

Prepared by: Tony Allen, CPPB, Procurement Officer