

---

## MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION January 21, 2016

Hatton Hall at the Governor Benjamin B. Moeur House Campus  
34 E. 7<sup>th</sup> Street, Tempe, AZ 85281  
6:00 PM

Commission Present:

Andrea Gregory, Chair  
Scott Solliday, Vice Chair  
Anne Bilsbarrow  
Chuck Buss  
Lauren Proper  
Brenda Shears  
Korri Turner

City Staff Present

Hunter Hansen, Planning  
Billy Kiser, HPO Intern  
John Larsen Southard, Historic Preservation Officer  
Bonnie Richardson, Public Works  
Mark Vinson, FAIA / AICP, City Architect

Commission Absent:

Ira Bennett

Chair Gregory called the meeting to order at 6:03 pm

1. Call to Audience:

- THPF representative asks that HPO consider a Papago Park Preserve Protection Plan for agendized discussion at a future meeting.

2. Consideration of meeting minutes: 11/12/2015

**Commissioner Bilsbarrow moved the Commission to approve the November 12, 2015 minutes as written. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and passed with a vote of 7-0.**

3. Request for a certificate of appropriateness proposed for redevelopment of portions of the St. Mary's Church / Our Lady of Mt. Carmel Catholic Church parcel for THE MAXWELL, located at 712 South College Avenue. The applicant is Tony Wall of Maxwell Tempe, LLC.

- Trevor Barger made a presentation on behalf of applicant – notes importance of the church to nearby community and ASU students
- Overview of recent additions to Newman Center on the St. Mary's Church property
- Description of previous dormitory housing proposals for the site
- Explanation of how proposal for The Maxwell differs from the previous proposals, in terms of height, structures, architecture, and distance from historic church
- Purpose is to build faith-based student housing
- Overview of development plans – two residential towers and a 4-story building transitioning from the historic church to the towers
- Developer is incorporating the same architectural designs as the adjacent College Avenue Commons building
- Detailed explanation of architectural transitions from historic to modern structures on the site
- Q: Does the 20-foot encroachment onto the College Avenue right-of-way obstruct the southward-looking view on College Avenue?
- A: The design will match the existing setback for College Avenue Commons
- Q: What is the logic behind the charcoal-colored patterning on the 4-story structure?

- A: This is intended to complement but not mimic the color and pattern scheme on the historic church – compatible but distinct
- Discussion of prior collaboration between St. Mary's Church / Newman Center and City of Tempe on construction projects, including ADA ramp
- Discussion on the window design for the 4-story structure, and explanation of why the design is rectangular and not rounded (to keep a compatible but distinct design that differentiates the historic from the new)
- Protection Plan would have to be approved by the Historic Preservation Officer, but would not require HPC approval

**Commissioner Proper moved the Commission to approve the certificate of appropriateness with staff recommendation that a protection plan be reviewed and approved by HPO prior to commencement of work. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Solliday and passed with a vote of 7-0.**

4. One - Hundred - Mill (Charles T. Hayden House / Monti's La Casa Vieja) project update – Manjula Vaz (Gammage & Burnham)
  - Presentation by Manjula Vaz on project progress: plat recently approved, façade conservation easement for entirety of the 1873-1924 building and airspace easement to be delivered prior to commencing onsite work
  - Kimpton hotel under contract to occupy one tower; working with potential restaurant tenants; will likely be at least two restaurants in historic Hayden House itself
  - Government Property Lease Excise Tax (GPLET) sets requirements that must be complied with: various easements; parking; time schedule; preservation and protection plan
  - Geotechnical engineer and geologist have both been hired for soil evaluation
  - Below-ground excavation will be 7-10 feet away from historic structure
  - Explanation of trenching plan and pre-construction evaluation plan
  - Overview of demolition and preservation plans
  - 3 major tasks: demolition plan and precise documentation of existing structure; detailed Historic American Building Survey (HABS) documentation; protection plan for historic building (PAD item #18)
  - Discussion of construction methods and techniques (Greg Burghardt, Hensel-Phelps representative)
  - Soil-shoring system will prevent possible cave-ins and would remain permanently in place once construction is completed
  - Soil-synching would be done incrementally as excavation goes deeper, and would strengthen the soil below the existing Hayden House foundation
  - Contractor will have a full-time superintendent on-site to monitor all activity while work is being done
  - Developer has submitted protection and demolition plans and will meet with city staff in coming days; developer will return to HPC with project update in 2-3 months
  - Status of PAD conditions of approval: HABS report mostly complete; archaeological monitoring plan has been revised and is pending approval from AZ State Museum; protection plan has been submitted and is pending city approval
  - Public comment: if damage to the Hayden House occurs during construction, work should stop immediately
  - Public comment: the adobe structure cannot sit vacant for long periods of time without deteriorating; comparison to recent work on the adobe at Eisendrath House; recommendation that developers hire an adobe consultant and arrange for regular upkeep and maintenance on the historic structure while it remains unoccupied
  - Public comment: 7-10 foot excavation setback between below-ground parking garage and historic structure is not adequate; request to consider moving back to a minimum of 10 feet at all places on the site
  - Public comment: request that excavation (for wiring, pipes, etc.) in that 7-10 foot interstitial space be done by hand to minimize vibration and possible damage to historic structure
  - [Members of the public provide extensive written comments to staff and commissioners regarding the demolition and protection plan – ask that staff and commissioners review those comments at their leisure](#)

- Q: Is soil-shoring described in the protection plan?
  - A: Yes, in appendix C
  - Q: What constitutes "irreparable damage" as quoted in the demolition and protection plans, and who makes the determination on whether or not "irreparable damage" has occurred?
  - A: City staff (community development director)
5. Tempe (Hayden) Butte Management Plan Overview – Bonnie Richardson (City of Tempe)
- Overview of radio antennas and towers on Tempe Butte and the difficulties entailed in their removal
  - Landscape architect provides overview of master plan: natural components and human history are the two areas of focus
  - This is only a municipal plan (not state or federal)
  - Discussion on need for archaeological awareness and sensitivity during work on Tempe Butte
  - This project is only intended to create a written plan and will conduct no actual physical or ground-disturbing work on the site
  - Collaboration with SRP-MIC ongoing
  - Discussion of city grant from SRP-MIC and conditions pertaining to Tempe Butte
  - Discussion about holiday displays on Tempe Butte
6. Urban Forestry Master Plan Overview – Bonnie Richardson (City of Tempe)
- Background information on project and its purposes
  - Overview of Urban Forestry Master Plan
  - Key project goals: urban cooling; walkability; reduction of heat island effect; wise use of water; shade expansion; increase property values; support biodiversity; respect habitat; preserve viewsheds
  - \$100,000 grant received for Urban Forestry project; explanation of upcoming events and outreach initiatives
  - Discussion of HOA participation in program and potential challenges
7. Chair / Staff Updates
- Southard named new chair of Scottsdale Historic Preservation Commission
  - Date Palm Manor and Tomlinson Estates have both been officially added to the National Register
  - Tomlinson Estates design guidelines are ongoing
  - Charlie Lee has resigned from HPC and will be replaced with a new professional member; Anne Bilsbarrow's term ends in March and she too will be replaced by a new professional appointment; Brenda Shears will be relocating and her HPC position will be filled with a new at-large member.

Chair Gregory adjourned the meeting at 8:26 p.m.

Prepared by: Billy Kiser, HPO Intern

Reviewed by: John Larsen Southard, Senior Planner / Historic Preservation Officer

  
Andrea Gregory, Chair