
**CITY OF TEMPE
REQUEST FOR COUNCIL ACTION****Council Meeting Date: 5/9/2013
Agenda Item: 5B10**

ACTION: Approve the issuance of one-year contracts with four one-year renewal options to Arizona Truck & Coach, Desert Edge Auto Body, Auto Body Specialists, All Pro Fleet Painting, Maaco Collision Repair & Auto Painting and Caliber Bodyworks of Arizona for vehicle body repairs and painting to be used by the Public Works Department.

FISCAL IMPACT: Total combined cost of these contracts will not exceed \$70,000. Sufficient funds have been appropriated in the General Fund – cost center 3262 – for the anticipated expenditure in the current fiscal year.

RECOMMENDATION: Approve the award of the contracts.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION: The City of Tempe issued a Request for Proposal (RFP) to establish contracts for vehicle body repairs and painting which is overseen by the Fleet Services Division of Public Works. Fleet Services has outsourced its auto body damage repairs since 2007. This work is highly specialized; an in-house program requires an inventory of large (space consuming) and expensive equipment, adherence to strict ADEQ air quality permit regulations, and a rigorous staff certification process to ensure compliance with all industry safety requirements. Given the relatively low number of vehicles requiring body repair on an annual basis, outsourcing the work is more cost effective and more efficient for serving our customers in city departments. Outsourcing specialty high cost items like body work is in alignment with Public Works' business strategy to staff for regular demand and supplement for peak or other high risk or specialty items in order to better stabilize our core work force.

The RFP requested services in three categories:

- General vehicles – repairs and painting
- Medium and heavy duty vehicle and equipment – repairs and painting
- Economy paint job

Ten proposals were received:

- Arizona Truck & Coach, LLC
- Desert Edge Auto Body LLC
- Vanguard Truck Center
- Auto Body Specialists Inc.
- Freightliner, Sterling, Western Star of Arizona
- All Pro Fleet Painting
- Maaco Collision Repair & Auto Painting
- RWC International
- Caliber Bodyworks of Arizona, Inc.
- American Collision Center, Inc.

American Collision Center failed to submit the required vendor offer form, therefore, they were considered non-responsive.

Evaluation Process

The proposals were evaluated by a committee comprised of Public Works and Procurement staff.

The responses were scored using the following criteria – sub categories carry equal weight unless otherwise noted:

Criteria	Weight
Cost	7 (44%)
Labor Rates	
Paint and Supplies	
Experience	5 (31%)
Firm	
Personnel	
References	
Site visit – if performed	
Warranty Offered	3 (19%)
Overall response to RFP	1 (6%)
Quality, composition & completeness	
Acceptance of terms and conditions	

Results of Scoring

General vehicles

Firm	Overall Score	Average Labor Cost (per hour)	Average Paint Cost (per hour)
Desert Edge	134.71	\$ 29.71	\$ 26.00
Auto Body Specialists	131.84	\$ 32.14	\$ 25.00
Caliber Bodyworks	130.92	\$ 40.00	\$ 25.00
Arizona Truck & Coach	125.11	\$ 41.00	\$ 24.00
Maaco	111.02	\$ 43.75	\$ 26.67

Medium and Heavy Duty Vehicles and Equipment

Firm	Overall Score	Average Labor Cost (per hour)	Average Paint Cost (per hour)
Arizona Truck and Coach	140.25	\$ 41.00	\$ 24.00
All Pro Fleet Painting	115.06	\$ 64.29	\$ 28.00
Vanguard Truck	113.77	\$ 73.57	\$ 42.00
RWC International	102.13	\$ 79.29	\$ 41.67
Freightliner, Sterling, Western Star of Arizona	102.13	\$ 78.60	\$ 47.50

Economy paint job

Firm	Overall Score	Average Whole Body Paint Cost
Arizona Truck and Coach	131.10	\$ 700.00
Maaco	128.50	\$ 512.50
Vanguard Truck	114.77	\$ 1,025.00
Desert Edge	108.21	\$ 1,198.75
Auto Body Specialists	104.49	\$ 1,175.00
All Pro Fleet Painting	92.27	\$ 1,475.00

Summary

It is the recommendation of the committee that contracts be awarded as follows:

General Vehicles

Desert Edge

Auto Body Specialists
Caliber Bodyworks
Arizona Truck & Coach

Medium and Heavy Duty Vehicles and Equipment
Arizona Truck and Coach
All Pro Fleet Painting

Economy paint job

Arizona Truck and Coach
Maaco

ATTACHMENTS: 13-085 Vehicle Bodywork and Painting Submittals

STAFF CONTACT(S): Kevin Devery, Interim Fleet Manager, (480) 350-8088

Department Director: Ken Jones, Finance & Technology Department Director

Legal review by: David Park, Assistant City Attorney

Prepared by: Tony Allen, CPPB, Procurement Officer