



## Minutes City Council Work Study Session March 17, 2016

Minutes of the Tempe City Council Work Study Session held on Thursday, March 17, 2016, 4:00 p.m., in the City Council Chambers, Tempe City Hall, 31 E. Fifth Street, Tempe, Arizona.

### **COUNCILMEMBERS PRESENT:**

Mayor Mark W. Mitchell  
Councilmember Robin Arredondo-Savage  
Councilmember Lauren Kuby  
Councilmember David Schapira

Vice Mayor Corey D. Woods  
Councilmember Kolby Granville  
Councilmember Joel Navarro

### **STAFF PRESENT:**

Andrew B. Ching, City Manager  
Judi Baumann, City Attorney  
Brigitta M. Kuiper, City Clerk  
Julian Dresang, Traffic Engineer

Ken Jones, Deputy City Manager – Chief Financial Officer  
Steven Methvin, Deputy City Manager – Chief Operating Officer  
Shelly Seyler, Deputy Public Works Director – Transportation  
Various Department Heads or their representatives

***Mayor Mitchell called the meeting to order at 4:32 p.m.***

### **Call to the Audience**

Christina Hudson, Tempe, stated that she regularly uses bike lanes for recreation and supports the recent street reconfiguration of McClintock Drive to accommodate the bike lanes between Broadway and Guadalupe roads. She supports the City's efforts to continue to make bicycling infrastructure improvements.

Shereen Lerner, Tempe resident and Tempe Transportation Commission member, conveyed support for the installation of bicycle lanes along McClintock Drive, but requested changes to the bike lane layout to benefit both bicyclists and motorists.

Chris Head, Scottsdale, Operations Manager at Lectric Cycles in Tempe, voiced support for the addition of separated bike lanes on McClintock Drive, noting that bike lanes offer opportunities for recreation, exercise, and transportation. Tempe has been ranked one of the best cycling cities in America in national publications.

Jenny Turner, Tempe, representing the Cole Park Neighborhood Association, spoke in opposition to the McClintock Drive bike lanes due to adverse impacts to safety and businesses in the area, and traffic congestion. She suggested restoring McClintock Drive to three vehicle lanes in each direction, widening the sidewalk and painting one half green specifically for bicycle use, and changing traffic signal timing.

Michael Arroyo, Tempe, spoke in opposition to the street reconfiguration of McClintock Drive due to concerns about heavy traffic, dangerous conditions for bicyclists, and hindered ingress and egress to and from adjacent neighborhoods. He voiced concern about the study used to develop the street reconfiguration project as there were only 466 responses out of a total population of approximately 180,000 Tempe residents.

Ryan Guzy, Tempe resident and Tempe Transportation Commission member, spoke in support of the McClintock Drive bike lanes and providing multiple safe transportation options on all roads. He reviewed statistics demonstrating how riding a bike on a sidewalk is unsafe.

Nick Miner, Tempe, spoke in opposition to the removal of vehicular traffic lanes from McClintock Drive to add bike lanes due to concerns about adverse impact on traffic flow. He noted inaccuracies in the staff report, dated March 7, 2016, containing data on use of the bike lanes, traffic volumes, and signal timing, as stated in his email to the City Council.

Joseph Mueller, Tempe, supports the street reconfiguration of McClintock Drive to accommodate the bike lanes. Tempe is a bicycle-friendly community. He uses the bike lanes for transportation regularly.

Russell Trotter, Tempe, noted that he commutes to work 34 miles each way by bicycle, and discussed the health and environmental benefits of bicycling. He expressed appreciation for the bike lane improvements on McClintock Drive and hopes that this will encourage people to use other modes of transportation besides cars.

Wendy Molina, Tempe, opposes the street reconfiguration of McClintock Drive due to increased traffic congestion. She bikes for recreation and rides on the sidewalks because the streets, even with bike lanes, are not safe. Tempe's multi-modal transportation infrastructure should accommodate both bicyclists and motorists. The sidewalks on McClintock Drive were originally designed extra wide to accommodate bike and pedestrian traffic.

Krista LaFever, Tempe, stated that the removal of vehicle lanes to add separated bike lanes on McClintock Drive has prevented her from accessing her neighborhood during rush hour, increased pollution up to 25%, increased commute times by 25%, and delayed the response time for emergency personnel due to backed up traffic. Only 4% of the Tempe population is bicycle commuters.

Joe Struttman, Tempe resident and Pecos Action Group member, noted that he bikes for fitness and commuting. He voiced support for the McClintock Drive bike lanes due to their safe width, effective buffer, and simple, clean design. Staff should continue collecting data on the street changes to McClintock Drive.

Kristian Doak, Tempe, voiced support for the street reconfiguration of McClintock Drive to add bike lanes because it provides a safer environment for both motorists and bicyclists, and encourages more bicyclists on this road. Bike lanes should be expanded on other roads.

Trevor Warren, Tempe, supports the street reconfiguration of McClintock Drive to accommodate the addition of dedicated bike lanes because it offers an alternative mode of transportation, encourages more people to travel by bicycle, and supports the local economy through increased retail sales.

Don Hawker, Tempe, stated that McClintock Drive should be restriped to its original configuration without bike lanes between Broadway and Guadalupe roads because this project was unreasonable and unnecessary, has slowed vehicular traffic and increased gasoline consumption. He bikes 10 miles a day to work and appreciates bicycle-friendly sidewalks, corner ramps, and reasonable lanes.

Bruce Nester, Tempe, representing the McClintock High School Site Council, supports bike lanes in general although he expressed concerns regarding increased traffic and safety issues in the neighborhoods and school zones adjacent to McClintock Drive, especially during school pick-up and drop-off times.

Diana Eberts, Tempe, opposes the addition of bike lanes on McClintock Drive due to increased traffic congestion, commute times, and risk of accidents. She suggested alternatives to the bike lanes to include providing an east-west bike path on Country Club Drive through the Arizona State University (ASU) Research area and to Baseline Road, and accommodating bicycle use on the sidewalks on McClintock Drive.

Sheila Scanlan, Tempe, expressed support for the street reconfiguration of McClintock Drive, and noted that Tempe is a progressive city. She believes the recent changes at the intersection of Guadalupe Road and McClintock Drive have made it easier for her to access her neighborhood. Ms. Scanlan noted a lack of lane markings in certain areas where lanes merge.

Shahin Rezai, Tempe, stated that he is opposed to the addition of bike lanes on McClintock Drive because reducing the traffic capacity on such a major arterial road by 33% was unreasonable and has led to an increase in carbon monoxide emissions.

He also opposes the installation of protective “candlesticks” in a one-mile portion between Southern Avenue and Baseline Road because they are unattractive. Mr. Rezai suggested alternatives to the McClintock Drive bike lanes to include reconfiguring Dorsey Lane to accommodate bike lanes or allowing bicycle use on sidewalks in this area.

Cliff Anderson, Tempe, conveyed support for the addition of bike lanes on McClintock Drive, and other bike facilities in Tempe because they improve the safety of bicyclists. He commutes to work by bicycle, as well as by car, and has observed several bicyclists using the bike lanes outside of rush hour. Completion of the road construction in Scottsdale should help ease traffic congestion on the Loop 101 Freeway.

Jessica Merrow stated that she resides in Mesa and works in Tempe. She spoke in opposition to the street reconfiguration of McClintock Drive due to increased vehicular traffic congestion and detrimental impacts to Tempe businesses from the decline in potential customers who avoid travelling in this area.

David Ellingson, Tempe, spoke in support of the McClintock Drive bike lanes because they provide opportunities for recreation and exercise, and a safer alternative to riding a bike on the sidewalk.

James Hanson, Tempe, opposes the addition of bike lanes on McClintock Drive. He suggested researching the use of protected bike lanes in Portland, Oregon. University Drive would benefit from protected bike lanes due to the significant number of bicyclists in the ASU area. He did not receive notification regarding the McClintock Drive bike lane project.

Neal Thomas, Tempe, stated that he rode his bicycle to this evening’s meeting by using the bike lane on McClintock Drive. As a car driver in the area, he shares the same concerns as other motorists, but as a bicyclist, he shares the same enthusiasm for the bike lanes as other bicyclists. Mr. Thomas believes that the implementation of the bike lanes was poorly executed, and the installation of the protective candlesticks has hindered the movement of motorists and bicyclists.

Steve Rath, Tempe, noted that he documented bike traffic on October 14, 2015, between 2 and 5 p.m., at the corner of Cornell and McClintock drives, where he counted four bicyclists; three were using the sidewalk and one was travelling the wrong way in the bike lane. He again documented bike traffic on March 15, 2016, between 2 and 5 p.m., at the same corner, where he counted five bicyclists; three were using the sidewalk. Mr. Rath supports the idea of wider sidewalks to accommodate bike traffic.

Brian Fellows, Tempe resident and Tempe Transportation Commission member, spoke in support of the McClintock Drive bike lanes because they provide safe access to the five schools on or within a half mile of this route.

Susan Conklu, Tempe resident and Tempe Transportation Commission member, voiced support for the installation of bicycle lanes along McClintock Drive because it increases pedestrian and bicyclist safety for ASU students, children, seniors, veterans, and other bike commuters. She also conveyed support for considering future projects for separated bike lanes and streetscape improvements along other roads in Tempe.

Justin Simon, Tempe, representing the Hudson Manor Neighborhood Association, spoke in support of the addition of bike lanes on McClintock Drive because it increases the safety of bicyclists. He and his family commute by light rail and bike and appreciate the public transit and rideshare services in the area.

Jeff Titone, Tempe resident and Tempe Bicycle Action Group (TBAG) Board member, expressed support for the McClintock Drive bike lanes because they encourage more people to bike and provide a safe route for bicyclists. Other activities contribute to traffic congestion in the area, such as ASU football games at Sun Devil Stadium.

Shaun Ylatupa-McWhorter, Tempe, spoke in support of the McClintock Drive bike lanes. He discussed his experiences bicycling to school as a child, and noted the importance of bike lanes for students in area schools.

Courtney Currier, Tempe, supports the McClintock Drive bike lanes because they provide a safe route for ASU students and employees who commute to campus by bike, and promote sustainability. She believes that the March 7, 2016 staff report does not have enough data to make an assessment at this time regarding traffic congestion. Additionally, more time is needed to raise public awareness regarding bike safety and etiquette.

Jason Phillips, Tempe resident and TBAG member, conveyed support for the bike lanes on McClintock Drive and continued improvements to Tempe's multi-modal transportation infrastructure. He has not owned a car since 2003 and commutes by bicycle. Mr. Phillips noted the importance of maintaining the safety of bicyclists and motorists sharing the road.

Patrick Valandra, Tempe resident and TBAG President, supports the addition of bike lanes on McClintock Drive because they provide safe, convenient access to the retail stores within the vicinity of Southern Avenue, McClintock Drive, and Broadway Road; promote bicycling; and, contribute to slower, calmer vehicle traffic.

Alessandra Booth, Tempe, described the personal and environmental benefits of bicycling. She expressed appreciation for the McClintock Drive bike lanes because they provide a safe environment for bicyclists of all skill levels.

Veronica Booth, Tempe, supports the bike lanes on McClintock Drive because they facilitate safe bike commuting for her and her family. She noted the dangers of riding a bicycle on the sidewalk as motorists usually do not check for bikes there.

Jeff Hawley, Tempe, expressed support for the installation of bicycle lanes along McClintock Drive and other streets because it encourages more people to move to Tempe and increases local business revenue. He participates in group bike rides that frequent Tempe businesses and restaurants for socializing. Bicycles are vehicles and belong on the road, not on the sidewalk.

Jon Austin, Tempe, spoke in favor of the McClintock Drive bicycle lanes because they provide a safer route for bicyclists, encourage more people to commute to work by bike, and slow down vehicle traffic.

Larry Sutherland, Tempe, voiced his support for the addition of bike lanes on McClintock Drive and other roads in Tempe to provide safer routes for bike commuters.

Anne Till, Tempe, spoke in support of maintaining the two vehicle lanes in each direction on McClintock Drive as they allow for slower and safer traffic. She has commuted by car along McClintock Drive for many years and has not noticed any difference in her ability to enter or exit her neighborhood or her commute time following the completion of the street reconfiguration project.

Dominick Tana, Tempe, spoke in opposition to the removal of vehicle lanes to add separated bike lanes on McClintock Drive. He travels on McClintock Drive daily and in the past three months he has seen only three bicyclists traveling on that road, two being on the sidewalk. The City should find an alternate way to accommodate bike travel.

John Krusemark, Tempe, spoke in opposition to the bike lanes on McClintock Drive due to increased vehicular traffic congestion, delays, daily commute time, and the low number of bicyclists on McClintock Drive. Motorists have been forced to use the center turn lane to bypass the heavy traffic, and have encountered difficulty entering and exiting the businesses along McClintock Drive. Although he supports many of the City's bike programs, the McClintock Drive street reconfiguration project has proven to be a failure. The City should restore McClintock Drive to three lanes of vehicle traffic in each direction, remove the candlesticks, and explore viable alternatives to accommodate bike travel.

Ed Hooten, Tempe, stated that the removal of vehicle lanes to accommodate bicycle lanes on McClintock Drive has created massive traffic back-ups into his neighborhood and has placed students travelling to and from Arredondo Elementary School at risk of injury. The data contained in the March 7, 2016 staff report demonstrated a 119.3% increase in travel time on McClintock Drive, from University Drive to Baseline Road. On 15 days between November, 2015 and March, 2016, between 7:00 and 8:30 a.m. and between 2 and 3 p.m., he and his neighbors observed an average of 4 to 6 bicyclists, with the majority riding on the sidewalk. People who bike on the sidewalk have indicated that they do not feel safe riding in the bike lane next to the cars.

Jon Greer, Tempe, opposes the street reconfiguration of McClintock Drive because it has increased his daily commute time and created a dangerous traffic bottleneck onto Apache Boulevard. McClintock Drive should revert back to three lanes of vehicle traffic in each direction. Mr. Greer suggested researching the use of wide sidewalks to accommodate bicyclists and pedestrians in Albuquerque, New Mexico.

Jessica Gracia, Mesa, supports the McClintock Drive bike lanes because they improve quality of life for bicyclists and provide a safer route to access retail stores, run errands, commute, and socialize. She encourages more bicycling infrastructure in Tempe.

Alison Quinn, Tempe, opposes the bike lanes on McClintock Drive due to the worsening traffic conditions in the area, lack of bicyclists using the lanes, increased traffic on Dorsey Lane, unsafe access to her neighborhood, and increased pollution from idling cars. People feel safer riding their bike on the sidewalk than in the bike lane.

Lloyd Thomas, Tempe resident and Tempe Transportation Commission member, supports the bicycle lanes on McClintock Drive and other biking infrastructure improvements in Tempe because they provide safe connectivity for bicyclists and improve their quality of life.

Gloria Adams, Tempe, stated that reducing McClintock Drive to two lanes of vehicle traffic in each direction to add separated bike lanes between Broadway and Guadalupe roads has caused heavy traffic congestion and adversely impacted ingress and egress to and from her neighborhood. Earlier today, she observed 15 bicyclists on McClintock Drive, with only three travelling in the bike lane. The sidewalks should be altered to accommodate bicycle use.

Janet Darcey, Tempe, spoke in favor of the bike lanes in Tempe as they make it safer for bicyclists. She discussed her experiences commuting to retail stores, her doctor's office, and the Tempe Public Library, by bike. Bicycling does not cause air pollution.

Jesus Mora, Tempe, expressed concerns regarding the traffic congestion impacts caused by the removal of vehicle lanes from McClintock Drive to nearby streets during rush hour.

Bonnie Gerepka, Tempe resident and Tempe Transportation Commission member, spoke in support of the separated bike lanes on McClintock Drive because they have improved this road, provided a viable option for bike commuters, and makes bicyclists more visible to motorists. The sidewalks are too narrow and dangerous for bicycles because cars exit the adjacent alleys and parking lots. The sidewalks are reserved for pedestrians or people using wheelchairs. She requested a safe bicycle passage on an arterial street in her neighborhood.

Robert Stein, Tempe, spoke in opposition to the proposed location of a possible seventh Tempe Fire Medical Rescue (FMR) Station at Estrada Park because it would encompass an eighth of the park and would affect the surrounding neighbors. Although he supports the need for an additional FMR Station, this location is inappropriate.

Tom Flynn, Tempe, opposes locating a new FMR Station at Estrada Park due to the low density character of this area. He suggested that the ASU Research Park would be a more appropriate location.

Councilmember Granville asked Mr. Flynn to speak with the Fire Chief regarding his concerns. He also noted that 85% to 90% of the calls for service received by the FMR Department are for emergency medical services; this number will increase as Tempe grows and the demand for services rises.

Denise Karastamatis, Tempe, representing the Estate La Colina Neighborhood Association, opposes the proposed location of the new FMR Station at Estrada Park due to concerns about the associated costs to the park and the surrounding community, safety and noise impacts, and increased traffic congestion on McClintock Drive. This park is the only site under consideration; other better suited locations should be considered. Ms. Karastamatis said she has spoken to the Fire Chief and received additional information.

William Nelson, Tempe, spoke in support of the bike lanes on McClintock Drive because they improve quality of life. He noted that it may take time for the bike lanes to be fully utilized.

*The meeting recessed at 6:14 p.m. and reconvened at 6:25 p.m. with all Councilmembers present.*

Mayor Mitchell announced that following the staff presentation and City Council discussion on the McClintock Drive Street Configuration Impacts, the Work Study Session will adjourn for the Regular Council Meeting.

## **Issue Review Session Items**

### **McClintock Drive Street Configuration Impacts**

Shelly Seyler, Deputy Public Works Director – Transportation, stated that at the December 3, 2015 Work Study Session, the City Council requested that staff provide pre and post traffic condition data along McClintock Drive between Broadway and Guadalupe roads as it relates to the repaving and installation of bicycle lanes. The McClintock Drive street reconfiguration project is consistent with the goals of Tempe's General Plan 2040 and Transportation Master Plan to create a multi-modal transportation system. Ms. Seyler presented background information on the McClintock Drive repaving project and removal of one vehicle lane in each direction to add bike lanes. Staff held an open house on May 4, 2015, to inform the public of the project. City Council approved the McClintock Drive repaving contract on May 7, 2015. The repaving project and inclusion of bicycle lanes occurred over the summer of 2015. In December, 2015, candlesticks were installed as a pilot project in a one-mile portion between Southern Avenue and Baseline Road to provide increased separation between vehicles and bikes.

Julian Dresang, Traffic Engineer, delivered a slide presentation reviewing background information on the lane reconfiguration of McClintock Drive and the addition of the bicycle lanes; historical vehicle counts on McClintock Drive; vehicle counts on McClintock Drive and Rural Road before and after the project; and, traffic signal timing adjustments. Data was presented regarding the before/after travel time comparisons on McClintock Drive, from University Drive to Baseline Road, and on Rural Road, from University Drive to Baseline Road; vehicular crashes between Apache Boulevard and Guadalupe Road; emission impacts caused by idling vehicles; and, bike counts on McClintock Drive collected in February, 2016.

Ms. Seyler reviewed the public comments/feedback and provided the most recent numbers. As of 4 p.m. yesterday, the City had received 506 comments (460 unduplicated) via email, online, or phone calls to Tempe 311, Councilmembers, or staff. Of the 460 unduplicated comments, 224 were against and 232 were in favor of the bicycle lanes. The City of Chandler has indicated that they will be narrowing medians on McClintock Drive and Kyrene Road to accommodate bicycle lanes south to the Loop 202 Santan Freeway. Staff recommends continuing to collect vehicle, bicycle, crash, and travel time data, and report back to the City Council every six months to provide comprehensive and statistically significant data.

In response to questions from Councilmembers, staff explained that vehicle traffic counts were conducted during the months and days with the highest traffic volumes. Traffic volume data was collected in March, 2014, and in January, 2016; additional data was collected between 2004 and 2014, generally in two-to-three-year increments. Data is not collected during construction projects. Level of service is an industry standard for measuring the quality of traffic service at an intersection, based on levels ranging from A to F, with A being the best and F being the worst.

Councilmembers and staff discussed travel time comparisons for morning and afternoon peak periods, adjustments to the traffic signal timing, and impacts of different inputs on the daily flow of traffic. Discussion continued regarding travel times for specific street sections, including Southern Avenue to University Drive, and impacts of the bike lanes on those sections.

Ms. Seyler reported that separate from McClintock Drive, staff is working with Arizona State University on a transportation study in the area of the Loop 101 Freeway to Priest Drive, including Apache Boulevard and Broadway Road, and identifying strategies to mitigate traffic. Applicants for new development projects that generate a certain number of vehicle trips must conduct traffic impact studies.

Councilmembers noted a lack of public involvement and communication on the McClintock Drive street reconfiguration project and construction timing. Staff should hold multiple public meetings to inform the public about planned projects to remove vehicle lanes. As bike lanes are provided or enhanced in other areas that connect to the downtown area, bike ridership on the major arterial roads is expected to increase. Councilmembers agreed that it is difficult to determine success or failure of a project when there is limited data; more time is needed to make a proper assessment.

Councilmembers further discussed that an objective of the General Plan 2040 is to achieve a more balanced transportation system and reduce reliance on the automobile. In addition, the Transportation Master Plan encourages removing vehicle lanes in areas where traffic level of service will not be significantly impacted and converting those lanes into bicycle lanes.

Councilmembers emphasized the importance of ensuring the safety of bicyclists and motorists when they are sharing the road. The following statistics from the *Spring 2015 Arizona Town Hall Background Report on Transportation and Arizona* were cited: bicycling against traffic increases accident risk by 3.6 times, and bicycling on the sidewalk in either direction increases accident risk by 2.3 times. Public safety issues should be considered when exploring improvements to the City's multi-modal transportation system, to include accommodations that serve the 4% bike commuter population, and new technologies and equipment that enhance the flow of traffic.

Councilmembers requested that staff collect and provide data on bus routes and times for schools in the vicinity of McClintock Drive, bicycle-vehicle crashes, impacts of bike lanes on vehicle emissions, traffic counts and travel times for various street segments, and bicyclists utilizing both the street and sidewalk. In addition, staff will explore the possibility of installing signage at the mid-block intersections telling drivers to not block the intersections; attend bike events around the community to educate people about bicycling; involve Tempe schools and solicit their feedback; and, solicit input from Police and Fire Medical Rescue personnel regarding impacts to their response times. Staff will provide an update in six months for City Council consideration and feedback.

*City Clerk's Note: Due to time constraints, the remaining Agenda Items, listed below, were continued to a March 29, 2016, Work Study Session.*

- *Fiscal Year 2016-17 Capital Improvement Program (CIP) Presentation*
- *Fire Station Location Update*
- *Bike Share Program Update*
- *Revitalization or Re-purposing of Commercial Strip Centers*
- *Branding/Communications Ad Hoc Committee Recommendations*
- *Internet Sales Transaction Location*
- *Electric Bike Ordinance*
- *Sustainability Coordination*
- *Animal Waste Removal in Right-of-Way*
- *Lobbyist Registration*

***The meeting adjourned at 7:29 p.m.***

I, Brigitta M. Kuiper, the duly-appointed City Clerk of the City of Tempe, Maricopa County, Arizona, do hereby certify the above to be the minutes of the City Council Work Study Session of March 17, 2016, by the Tempe City Council, Tempe, Arizona.

---

Mark W. Mitchell, Mayor

ATTEST:

---

Brigitta M. Kuiper, City Clerk