TEMPE PRESERVATION

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Anne Bilsborrow
Elias Y. Esquer
Bob Gasser, Chair
Charlie Lee, Alternate
Dan Killoren
Kriste Melcher
Ann Patterson
Liz Wilson, Vice-Chair

♦ ♦ ♦

HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICE

Amy Douglass
Hunter Hansen
Joe Nucci
Mark C. Vinson

♦

The City of Tempe is a Certified Local Government, in association with the United States Department of the Interior / National Park Service

♦

Tempe Historic Preservation Office
Community Development Department
21 East 6th Street, Suite 208
P.O. Box 5002
Tempe, AZ 85280

♦ ♦ ♦

480.350.8028
8579 FAX; 8913TDD

CITY OF TEMPE ARIZONA

Tempe Historic Preservation Commission [Tempe HPC]

MEETING MINUTES

Meeting Date: Thursday, December 10, 2009

Location: Hatton Hall, 34 East Seventh Street

Commissioners Present: Anne Bilsbarrow, Elias Y. Esquer, Bob Gasser, Dan Killoren, Ann Patterson, Liz Wilson

Alternates Present: Charlie Lee

Staff Present: Chris Messer, Hunter Hansen, Joe Nucci, Mark Vinson

Public Present: Vic Linoff, Karen Gitlis, Phil Douglass, Bob and Virginia Sandstad

Call to Order: 6:00 PM, Bob Gasser, Chair

1. **Call to Audience**
   - No public comments

2. **Approval of HPC Minutes:** 11/12/09 Tempe HPC meeting
   ***MOTION**: TO APPROVE THE 11/12/09 MINUTES WITH ONE MINOR CORRECTION [LW], SECOND [DK]; **APPROVED**: UNANIMOUSLY, [6-0] WITH GASSER ABSTAINING*

3. **Neighborhood Meeting Douglass/Gitlis House Historic Designation & Listing**
   ZDC 6-402 meeting for historic 1935 Douglass/Gitlis House at 1206 S. Ash Avenue
   - Opening legal narrative read into record
   - Home has been modified as many as 3 times; need info on nature of additions and if the garage has always been detached
   - Encourage Commissioner to drive by property before next meeting
   - Two newer buildings to rear of property screened from view [exempt from consideration / listing]
   - DRC – December 22 deadline due to Staff Summary Report
   - Eligibility discussion required – specific elements of the report for future consideration of additions to weigh factors which may or may not effect integrity
   - Q: The Name of the property? A: It is currently the Karen Gitlis and Phil Douglass Residence. Very little info exists on county records prior. Was the 'Larken' Residence in 1985. Properties are named after current residents with known historic name in parenthesis.
   - Recommendation: trace records back to incite history
   - Glass block curve / architecture fits the Sec. of Interior's Standards for compatible yet distinct; good case study for 'How to do it right' re: residential modifications
   - The first occurrence of this style was 1935 in masonry
   - One of only 2 Early Ranch style homes (1935) remaining in Tempe; the other is rendered unrecognizable
   - From the earliest period of Ranch
   - Q: Is the siding original? A: Yes, its wood.
   - NEIGHBORHOOD SUPPORT: "I support this."
   - NEIGHBORHOOD SUPPORT: "I love the construction / material. The (designation) process is gratifying to me."
   - 1932 – in California, Cliff May Homes first use of 'Ranch' term

[cont.]

- Gitlis: report was an eye-opener; very professional; surprised to discover importance of my home. There are several individual properties in Maple-Ash (this is 1 of 9 to date) that have come forward; encouraging others to do the same.
- 1/10th of 1% of total properties in Tempe are age-eligible [pre-1941]; consideration of rarity of property requires acceptance / flexibility in determination of integrity, modifications, changes
- Linoff: "I absolutely support it"
- Closing legal narrative read into record
- January 14, 2010 Public Hearing at HPC

4. Discuss and Consider Harrington Birchett House Staff Update
Chris Messer update on redevelopment & disposition agreement with ASU

- Property owner, ASU, has been approached by potential restaurateur interested in the Harrington Birchett House
- The restaurateur is interested in maintaining it the way it is, similar to House of Tricks, with a kitchen in the garage and dining in the main residence
- ASU has hired Consultant Don Ryden to assess costs / rehab options / upkeep
- Quid pro quo agreement in discussion with developer across the street which could funnel through the City to ASU
- Based on Ryden's study, then restaurateur will negotiate a lease agreement with ASU
- ASU issued an RFP for Block 12 which calls for a mixed-use project with a newly relocated ASU bookstore
- Block 12 redevelopment would step down to address the scale of the HBH
- ASU would still own HBH, and lease it to restaurateur who is looking at cost and lease rate for feasibility
- GPLET option = government owns property and leases it to private sector; reduced rate in excise tax; abatement for 8 years in exchange
- The development across the street may not happen
- ASU has agreed to conservation easement in theory
- History, landscape elements, Guess Birchett's connection to site / Tempe Beautification are all important to convey sense of place and authenticity; pass summary of this info along to potential developer and ASU

5. Discuss and Consider Tempe Pass-thru Grant from SHPO (SRP-MIC match)
Update on employing student interns Billy Kiser and John Southard

- John Southard starts next week; Bill Kiser has already started
- Kiser: two potential directions for Tempe (Hayden) Butte NRN:
  1.) Criteria A. Event / History under Site (1870s – 1959) for significance as local landmark (location, setting, feeling, association)
  2.) Criteria D. Likely to Yield / Has Yielded under Site (600 A.D. – 1959) for significance as cultural landscape (location, materials)
- ***CONSENSUS***: To pursue Tempe (Hayden) Butte NRN under Criteria D. Site – which is the most inclusive option; includes proto-historic narrative and elements.

6. Discuss and Consider Meeting with the Mayor at January HPC
Determine topics of discussion for legal posting by City Clerk Office

- ***CONSENSUS***: For staff to edit "Preliminary Tempe HPC Agenda for January 14, 2010" to include: Designations, Funding and Vision as a bulleted (instead of numbered) list; shorten staff's draft list of topics; add 'Tempe Municipal Building (City Hall)' and 'Vision for Future of Preservation' as bullet items.

7. Discuss and Consider Designation & Listing of Hayden Flour Mill + Silos
Recommend completion of designation with second public hearing and council action

- Discussion with Andrew Ching (City Attorney's office) concluded we can resume designation process where we left off if political will is such
- Designation process should assist; if misconceptions arise then they should be dispelled
- ***CONSENSUS***: To talk to Mayor Hallman at the January 2010 meeting and ask for support of continuing process of designation of HFM+S.

8. Discuss and Consider Designation & Listing of Sandra Day O'Connor House
Determine commission action plan

- 'Historic Landmark' category relates to visual aspect of properties not yet 50 years age-eligible
- Relocation is only considered as last resort
- Preliminary determination from SHPO that property needs to convey importance in association with Sandra Day O'Connor – not location (see 'Aspects of Integrity' matrix – Criteria B. Person = materials, feeling, association)

9. Discuss and Consider HPC Actions at Ad Hoc and Council Committees – *INFORMATION ONLY*

- Gasser update on Papago Park Master Plan Committee Ad Hoc Committee
- Gasser update Neighborhood Parks Rehabilitation & Maintenance CC
- Killoren update Technology, Economic & Community Development CC
- Killoren update Mill & Lake District Working Committee
- NEED HPC REP FOR Quality of Life Working Committee
- Wilson update Housing Council Committee

10. Discuss and Consider Chair / Staff Updates: – *INFORMATION ONLY*

- DRAFT letter to President Crow re: Valley National Bank Building (relocation of dome)
  CONSENSUS: To draft letter to ASU for preservation-related projects; this was not a preservation project.
- Interest in designation dialog from Hudson Manor Neighborhood Association Chair
  Phil Amorosi, Hudson Manor NA, will attend January 2010 meeting

11. Current Events / Announcements / Future Agenda Items– *INFORMATION ONLY*

- Member Announcements
- Staff Announcements
  – Annual SHPO statewide CLG Conference Flagstaff May 13 & 14 (Thu & Fri) – 4 Commissioners + 3 staff initially interested
  – HP Plaque Program update – HPO at Foundation 11/18/09 – needs to be redesigned due to partnership potential
  – RAHD Design Guidelines – Neighborhood Meetings 11/17/09 & 12/07/09 – February 2010 HPC meeting
- Next HPC Meeting Date Thursday, 01/14//2010 6:00 p.m. Hatton Hall with Mayor Hugh Hallman

Adjourn

Meeting adjourned at 8:22 PM

Minutes scheduled for Tempe HPC approval on 01/14/2010.

Bob Gasser, Chair

Rdevpub/HistoricPreservation/HPCmins121009.doc

HPCmins121009.doc filed City Clerk 01/15/10 Fillmore, Karen & posted to www.tempe.gov/historicpres

Draft issued for review comments to:	Review comments received from:
☑	☑

FREQUENTLY USED ABBREVIATIONS OR ACRONYMS

CDD – City of Tempe Community Development Department: Established February 15, 2005, by City Manager Will Manley the CDD consists of six divisions; Economic Development, Housing Services, Redevelopment, Neighborhood Enhancement, Rio Salado/Town Lake, and Special Projects, as well as the Community Design Studio / City Architect. The Tempe Historic Preservation Office is an agency of the Special Projects Division.

CLG – Certified Local Government: In 1980, Congress established a framework for local preservation programs through an amendment to the National Historic Preservation Act empowering Arizona cities and counties to become Certified Local Governments (CLGs). Once certified, these entities are eligible for specialized assistance and funds for developing their own local preservation programs and entitled to comment on NR and other SHPO activities within their boundaries. The City of Tempe became a CLG in 1995.

DDA – Development & Disposition Agreement: a redevelopment contract between the City and one or more developers or redevelopers specifying terms and conditions for construction or reconstruction.

DSD – City of Tempe Development Services Department: dealing with Building Safety, Land Use, Planning and Zoning

DRC – City of Tempe Development Review Commission: volunteer board advising Mayor and Council on matters related to the built environment and administration of General Plan 2030 and the Zoning and Development Code.

HPAC – Historic Preservation Advisory Committee: Arizona State Parks is governed by the State Parks Board and receives direction and oversight from several advisory committees and groups such as the Historic Preservation Advisory Committee.

IEBC – International Existing Building Code: adopted by Tempe City Council by Ordinance No. 2005.89 on December 1, 2005, as part of the code body promulgated by the International Code Council, provides means for preservation of existing Tempe building inventory through reasonable and feasible code processes.

IRS – Issue Review Session: informal Mayor and Council public meeting where members of the public may come forward and talk with City Council during the "Call to the Audience" prior to regular Council meetings.

PAD – Planned Area Development: site plan overlay to define development standards for a specific project.

SHPO – State Historic Preservation Office: a division of Arizona State Parks, responsible for the identification, evaluation, and protection of Arizona's prehistoric and historic cultural resources; established by the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966.

SRP-MIC – Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community: created by Executive Order on June 14, 1879 by President Rutherford B. Hayes, the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community (SRPMIC) is located in Maricopa County, aside the boundaries of Mesa, Tempe, Scottsdale, Fountain Hills and metropolitan Phoenix.

Tempe HPC – Tempe Historic Preservation Commission: Created by Ordinance 95.35, adopted November 9, 1995. Members serve three year terms with the exception of the initial appointments; charged with administering the Tempe Historic Preservation Ordinance and Plan, as well as advising Mayor / Council on all matters related to historic preservation

Tempe HPF – Tempe Historic Preservation Foundation: A private nonprofit corporation established in 2005, Mission Statement 02.02.06 "The Tempe HPF advocates preserving Tempe's at-risk historic properties and supporting worthy preservation projects through education, community participation, and fundraising."

Tempe HPO – Tempe Historic Preservation Office: Responsible for the identification and conservation of Tempe's prehistoric and historic cultural resources, the Office uses Federal, state, and city funding for the historic preservation program and assists owners of historic properties with grant applications, property maintenance, and preservation activities; provides staff support to the Tempe HPC.

THM – Tempe Historical Museum: Located at 809 E. Southern Avenue in Tempe, the Tempe Historical Museum is a center where the community comes together to celebrate Tempe's past and ponder the future. Permanent and changing exhibits, educational programs, and research projects generally focus on some aspect of Tempe's history within the context of state and national events.

TOD – Tempe Transportation Overlay District: placed to encourage appropriate land development and redevelopment consistent with and complementary to the community's focused investment in transit, bicycle, and pedestrian infrastructure in certain geographic areas of the City; typically in association with the light rail.

ZDC – Zoning & Development Code: Adopted by Mayor and Council on January 20, 2005, effective February 22, 2005, the ZDC implements Tempe General Plan 2030 by encouraging creative development of the built environment in order to build a community that promotes the livability and uniqueness of Tempe; establishes zoning districts and development standards.